Board Members in Attendance: Nate Brown, Ben Castro, Cathy Kahlow, Carrie Westberg

Board Members in Attendance via Conference call: David Kottler, Aaron Newman, Gary Resnick

Absent: None

Staff Present: Brian Hanton, Justine Kadziel, Matt Strader, Megan Suhadolc

Attending Guests: Jed Easterbrook from FieldTurf, Jason & William Berry (Pinebrook), Bo White (Pinebrook)

The special meeting of May 29, 2018 was called to order by Chair Castro at 4:59pm.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE APPROVAL OF THE FIELDHOUSE ARTIFICIAL TURF REPLACEMENT PROJECT

At the May 17 Board meeting, Board members asked Staff to research additional alternative products to the crumb rubber proposal presented. Strader worked with the staff from FieldTurf and has presented the Board with two Bid Alternate options. As a reminder, the Base Bid included a patented 3-layer system consisting of Silica sand, Cryogenic rubber, and two types of synthetic fibers. The bid amount was $168,768. Bid Alternate #1 is an eco-friendly infill material top layer and a sand mix at the lower level of the turf. Bid Alternate #1 also includes a shock pad under the turf. Bid Alternate #1 would cost an additional $70,437.50. Bid Alternate #2 is an eco-friendly infill material top layer and a rubber/sand mix at the lower level of the turf. This alternate does not include a shock pad but does include lengthening of the turf fibers to 2 ½ inches (from 2 ¼ inches) for better performance, safety, and maximum cool play material to keep any rubber and sand mix at the bottom. Bid Alternate #2 would cost an additional $26,280. Strader showed the Board an example of what Bid Alternate #2 would look like.

Kottler asked Resnick if he was able to get in touch with anyone from the Environmental Protection Agency regarding the study that is being done on the turf fields. Resnick said he was unable to reach anyone.
Strader also reported to the Board that he discussed with and toured the University of Utah fields, where FieldTurf had installed the infill product that consists of the two-layer system of sand/rubber at the bottom and then the eco-friendly, non-rubber product “cool play” at the top layer. Because the infill system still contains some rubber to achieve the minimum G-Max standards, it does not need an additional shock pad under the turf. The same product was installed for the middle school and high school fields of the Boulder Colorado School District, and Staff received positive feedback on these fields from the Boulder Superintendent.

Kottler asked for Staff’s recommendation, specifically from Strader and Hanton. Strader stated that, from the research he had done, he was in favor of Bid Alternate #2 due to the lower cost and the fact that a shock pad was not needed. He did not feel this would impact performance and though there would still be some crumb rubber, it would be mixed in with the sand at the lower level, minimizing exposure to users. Hanton mirrored Strader’s remarks and explained that he was comfortable with any of the options presented but felt that Bid Alternate #2 would provide a happy medium.

Resnick shared that he did quite a bit of research and felt that it appears that if there is a health effect, it is extremely low, because it is not being detected, although significant effort has been spent by the scientific community and the public health community. He felt that at Washington State, where the issue originally surfaced from a coach’s concern, it turned out that the increase risk of cancer that she thought existed was in a cohort of soccer players that played mostly on grass fields. Resnick felt that at this point, there is zero indication in literature that there is a health effect. He fully appreciates the fact that there are toxic materials in crumb rubber, just as there are in tires, but at this moment he can find no definitive information, although people have looked now for several years. Resnick asked if anyone had any peer-reviewed data that suggests there is, in fact, a health risk, even from ingestion. Hanton shared that he had not been able to find any data suggesting that health risk. Newman added that when he did some research, he discovered from the National Intramural and Recreation Sports Administration that the Bid Alternate #2 option is the preferred option for athletes by colleges and universities.

Kahlow asked if the members of the public present at the meeting would like to give feedback to the Board.

Bo White shared that this topic has not been studied for that long. He explained that there is a lot of science surrounding this issue and that there have been reports and research included in many peer-reviewed journals that he would be happy to share with the Board. Most of the analysis and outcomes of those papers have been inconclusive because, in part, the difficulty in determining how this material is ingested. He said that we know for certain that there are carcinogens in crumb rubber and he encouraged Board members to attend a youth program and see how much of that material is on the hands and bodies of the participants. He urged the Board to review all the options and not make any rush decisions. He hoped the Board would take a holistic view of the cost associated with this and compare it to potential costs of lawsuits down the line, employee health effects, public outcry, etc. He shared his concern that Staff had not talked with enough parties nor did they provide different alternatives in a full evaluation matrix. He added that the public would be happy to help in gathering this research with Staff.

Jason Berry reiterated the concerns of Bo White and hoped that Board members would err on the side of caution regarding this issue. This material is in contact with children consistently. He felt that if in 10 years it is determined that this is a major issue, $50,000 will seem insignificant. He commended
Staff and Board for looking at a different alternative but still has concerns that over time and much use, the crumb rubber will end up being exposed at the surface like it is now. He also appreciated the fiduciary responsibility of the Board but, with a potential health risk at stake, he would prefer to cut back in another area.

Kottler asked if there was a consensus of the Board. Castro shared that he was in favor of Bid Alternate #2 based off Staff’s research and feedback from the University of Utah and Boulder School District. Resnick shared that due to the presence of crumb rubber in Bid Alternate #2, he was confused as to why Bid Alternate #2 would be less risky. Kottler said that one of the primary factors in his decision is not whether one product is safer than another. He is not as concerned with the reality as he is with the perception. He shared that he was not sure if it would make sense to delay a decision until more research is conducted. From what Kottler understands and the experts have shared, all options are equally safe. Resnick shared that though the health effects directly associated have been discussed, the value of recycling tire for the environment hasn’t been discussed. He also pointed out that the highest probability here is that one cannot prove a negative and so if indeed the additional health risks associated with crumb rubber is negligible as it might indicate due to the decades of use without detection, then delaying this and studying it further is probably of little value. Resnick felt that there is no value in delaying a decision because he doesn’t think any information will come out that satisfies the concerns. Castro also brought up that the current field is becoming a safety factor. Resnick shared that he was in favor of the Base Bid and Kottler shared that he was in favor of Bid Alternate #1 or waiting until the EPA report is published.

MOTION: To approve and award the contract for the turf replacement at The Fieldhouse to FieldTurf in the amount of $168,768, plus the additional $26,280, and to allow the District Director to execute the necessary documents. [Newman/Brown] All in favor: Nate Brown, Ben Castro, Cathy Kahlow, Aaron Newman, Carrie Westberg. Opposed: David Kottler, Gary Resnick. Absent: None. Motion carries.

At 5:27pm, Chair Castro called for a motion to adjourn the meeting.


MOTIONS

MOTION: To approve and award the contract for the turf replacement at The Fieldhouse to FieldTurf in the amount of $168,768, plus the additional $26,280, and to allow the District Director to execute the necessary documents. [Newman/Brown] All in favor: Nate Brown, Ben Castro, Cathy Kahlow, Aaron Newman, Carrie Westberg. Opposed: David Kottler, Gary Resnick. Absent: None. Motion carries.

Minutes prepared by Justine Kadziel

Clerk/Board Member Approval: [Signature]

Snyderville Basin Special Recreation District
Special Board Meeting May 29, 2018